

# Residential security, marginalisation and social protection

Haris Gazdar and Hussain Bux Mallah

# 1. Motivation and context

- Housing high on social protection agenda in developed countries but not developing countries
- Pakistan SP agenda low priority, then change
- Rural areas – traditional formal and informal arrangements for accessing homestead
- Urban growth in irregular settlements
- SP agenda: right; administrative; equality

## 2. Interventions

- Rural Punjab
  - Punjab Marla Scheme (PMS) – 1974
- Rural Sindh
  - Sindh Goth Abad Housing (SGAH) – 1985
- Karachi
  - Sindh Katchi Abadi Authority (SKAA) – 1985
- Politics, dormancy, renewed interest
- Implementation approaches: supply or demand-driven

### 3. Methodology and data

- Secondary quantitative data on home tenure not very useful, as yet
- Qualitative methods: community histories, moments of change, individual cases
- In-depth focus on rural and urban sites where prior work and knowledge
- Comparison between, within site main source of insight

## 4. Findings from rural Punjab

- Caste-based marginalisation and vulnerability to bonded labour
- Traditional hierarchical village organisation, change, but customary obligation converted into civil dependence
- Scheme impact non-reversible – one-off ‘emancipation’ – exclusion arbitrary
- Poverty yes, but also opportunity

## 5. Findings from rural Sindh

- Local landowning elite assert claims even when state-owned land used for homestead – formal legal basis, unreformed
- Conflict and contestation, settlement formation closely linked to this
- Scheme became part of collective actions of upwardly mobile groups
- But not extreme marginalised

## 6. Findings from Karachi

- Migration as a route out of marginalisation but opportunities conditioned by prior social and political position
- Lots of collective action, around kinship, ethnicity, leadership – leading up to incremental regularisation
- Scheme not start but culmination
- Exclusion and change

## 8. Residential insecurity and marginalisation

- Processes of social marginalisation almost inevitably linked to security of tenure and ownership of home; plus access etc
- Contests also most frequently around this issue – thus a focal point for mobilisation
- Contests with dominant groups (rural), land agents and state agencies (urban)
- Still, many grades of security/insecurity, and therefore, still strong rationale for such interventions



## 9. Moments of change

- Political changes – which provided additional possibilities to the marginalised, including schemes (rural Punjab)
- Conflict and violence – general contestation of property rights (rural Sindh)
- Migration and identity change (Karachi)
- Individual mobility and opportunity, but also often linked to secure residence

# 10. Wider social protection debate

- New context: large-scale cash transfer programme, plus renewed policy interest in land allotment
- Who is counted – operational issue
- Land allotment yet focused on farming
- Strategic matter of supply versus demand-driven
  - Rigorous administrative coverage to counter exclusion
  - ... But scope for demand-driven as become part of mobilisation strategy of marginalised
  - Expect patriarchal collective action, unless.....