Tackling chronic poverty

The policy implications of research on chronic poverty and poverty dynamics
Tackling chronic poverty

The policy implications of research on chronic poverty and poverty dynamics

Andrew Shepherd

with contributions from many people in the Chronic Poverty Research Centre network, and research assistance from Lucy Scott
Acknowledgements

Tackling chronic poverty: The policy implications of research on chronic poverty and poverty dynamics has been written at the end of a ten year research and policy engagement process with the help of many people in the Chronic Poverty Research Centre (CPRC) and outside. The key messages were first discussed with CPRC directors, then circulated to partners, many of whom commented. It was presented internally at a CPRC partners meeting in September, and to the Centre’s Advisory Review Group prior to its first public presentation at the CPRC conference ‘10 years of war against poverty’ in Manchester, UK. It then went through two further drafting rounds with additional comments from a team at DFID, as well as further comments from CPRC partners.

This report was written by Andrew Shepherd, with research assistance principally from Lucy Scott. Many people in the CPRC contributed to the writing of this paper. Particular thanks go to: Abdou Salam Fall, Amita Shah, Aasha Kapur Mehta, Abena Oduro, Anand Kumar, Andries du Toit, Andy McKay, Armando Barrientos, Bara Gueye, Binayak Sen, Bob Baulch, Caroline Harper, Charles Lwanga-Ntale, David Hulme, David Neves, Kate Bird, Rosemary Kaduru, Rokhaya Cissé, Sam Hickey, Shashanka Bhide, Zulfiqar Ali; members of the Advisory Group: especially Jo Beall, Margaret Kakande, Julian May, Santosh Mehrotra, Paul Shaffer; and also to Andy Norton at ODI, Tony German at Development Initiatives, Sascha Reebs, Hildegarde Lingnau, Jane Sautter, Christina Hackmann and Angela Langenkamp at BMZ and GIZ, Tim Conway, Katie Chapman, Jo McGowan, Jo Macrae, and Zoe Stephenson, all at DFID. Particular thanks to Jo McGowan and Julia Brunt for steady and painstaking working through the process to bring this paper to fruition. Thanks also goes to Roo Griffiths for editorial support; Portia Reyes for proofreading, design and layout; and Anna Simmons for production support.

About the principal author:

Andrew Shepherd is Director of the Chronic Poverty Research Centre at the Overseas Development Institute. He has worked throughout a long career on rural poverty reduction, rural development, food security and related issues as an academic and practitioner.

This document is an output from the Chronic Poverty Research Centre (CPRC), which is funded by UKaid from the UK Department for International Development (DFID) for the benefit of developing countries. The views expressed are not necessarily those of DFID. The CPRC gratefully acknowledges DFID’s support.

Front cover picture credits:

Top left: © G.M.B. Akash / Panos Pictures.
Top right: © Giacomo Pirozzi / Panos Pictures.
Bottom left: © Randy Plett / istockphoto.
Bottom right: © Atul Loke / Panos Pictures.

This report can be downloaded from the CPRC website: www.chronicpoverty.org
Copyright 2011 © Chronic Poverty Research Centre
ISBN 978-1-906433-78-9
The Chronic Poverty Research Centre (CPRC) is an international partnership of universities, research institutes and NGOs, established in 2000 with initial funding from the UK’s Department for International Development (DFID).

CPRC Director:
Dr Andrew Shepherd, Overseas Development Institute

CPRC Associate Directors:
Dr Caroline Harper, Overseas Development Institute
Professor David Hulme, University of Manchester
Professor Andy McKay, University of Sussex

CPRC Programme Manager:
Julia Brunt, Overseas Development Institute

CPRC is administered from:
Brooks World Poverty Institute
School of Environment and Development
The University of Manchester
Humanities Bridgeford Street
Manchester, M13 9PL
UK

Phone: +44 (0)161 306 6436
Fax: +44 (0)161 306 6428
e-mail: cprc@manchester.ac.uk
website: www.chronicpoverty.org

CPRC partners
Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies (BIDS) – Programme of Research on Chronic Poverty in Bangladesh (PRCPB), Dhaka, Bangladesh
Brooks World Poverty Institute (BWPI), University of Manchester, Manchester, UK
Department of Economics, University of Sussex, Falmer, Brighton, UK
Development Initiatives (DI), Somerset, UK
Development Research and Training (DRT), Kampala, Uganda
Economic Policy Research Center (EPRC), Kampala, Uganda
HelpAge International, London, UK

Indian Institute of Public Administration (IIA), New Delhi, India and CPRC-India partners:
- Gujarat Institute of Development Research, Gujarat, India.
- Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi, India.
- National Council of Applied Economic Research, New Delhi, India.

Innovation, Environnement et Développement en Afrique (IED Afrique), Dakar, Senegal. Regional Coordinator CPRC West Africa. Country focal points:
- CEDRES, Faculté des Sciences Economiques et de Gestion, Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso
- Department of Economics, University of Ghana, Legon, Ghana
- IFAN, Université Cheikh Anta Diop, Dakar, Senegal
- Réseau MARP, Niamey, Niger

Institute for Development Policy and Management, University of Manchester, Manchester, UK
Overseas Development Institute (ODI), London, UK
Programme for Land and Agrarian Studies (PLAAS), University of the Western Cape, Bellville, South Africa

CPRC affiliates
Institute of Development Studies, Nairobi, Kenya
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BRAC</td>
<td>Building Resources Across Communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPRC</td>
<td>Chronic Poverty Research Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CREATE</td>
<td>Consortium for Research on Educational Access, Transitions and Equity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Civil Society Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFID</td>
<td>UK Department for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DHS</td>
<td>Demographic and Health Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRT</td>
<td>Development Research and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPN</td>
<td>Global Production Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFAD</td>
<td>International Fund for Agricultural Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFPRI</td>
<td>International Food Policy Research Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IIPA</td>
<td>Indian Institute of Public Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPC</td>
<td>International Poverty Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDG</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGNREGA</td>
<td>Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCAER</td>
<td>National Council of Applied Economic Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRGF</td>
<td>Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRS</td>
<td>Poverty Reduction Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRSC</td>
<td>Poverty Reduction Support Credit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOUP</td>
<td>Research Consortium on Educational Outcomes and Poverty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMEs</td>
<td>Small and Medium Enterprises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ST</td>
<td>Scheduled Tribe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>UN Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>World Health Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Chronic Poverty Research Centre (CPRC) was founded in 2000 to challenge, through research, the apparent omission of almost a billion people from the 2015 poverty target of the Millennium Development Goals. The first decade of the 21st century has illustrated the power of economic growth (especially in China) and human development to bring large numbers out of poverty. But a large number of people remain abjectly poor, among them almost half a billion people who are poor over long periods of time, their entire lives, and who may pass poverty to their children. The essential argument advanced in this report is that if these people are to escape poverty beyond 2015, they require additional policies and political commitment, underpinned by greater understanding and analysis, compared to what is currently practiced at global and national levels.

The CPRC has been a partnership of 10 developing country teams in Bangladesh, Burkina Faso, Ghana, India, Kenya, Niger, Senegal, South Africa, Tanzania and Uganda, with UK poverty researchers based at Manchester University, the Overseas Development Institute, London and other universities and Non-Governmental Organisations. It has pursued distinct and context-driven programmes of research and policy engagement at country level, as well as cross country thematic research on concepts, poverty dynamics and inter-generational transmission, assets, vulnerability, social exclusion and adverse incorporation. This has generated both quantitative and qualitative evidence about the extent, nature, causes and consequences of both chronic poverty and poverty dynamics, unpacking what has been a ‘poverty black box’, in partner countries and beyond. The international Chronic Poverty Reports have generated a global picture of chronic poverty and how to address it through better policies. Country partners have also produced summative reports at the national level. Other topical reports include Stemming Girls’ Chronic Poverty on approaches to reforming the discriminatory social institutions which shape the realm of possibilities for girls and their families.

In one respect, mainstream thinking about poverty reduction has changed significantly during the decade of CPRC’s existence. In 2000, social protection was on the international anti-poverty agenda as a measure against vulnerability to poverty under the World Bank’s ‘social risk management framework’. Following research carried out by CPRC and others (notably the Institute of Development Studies), and significant policy experimentation by governments, donors and NGOs, social transfers are now widely recognised as instruments which address chronic and extreme poverty. This is now a full fledged ‘third leg’ accompanying economic growth and human development in mainstream poverty reduction efforts, though with so far slow progress in low income countries. The existence of this ‘third leg’ is just as well, since the past decade has also brought further threats to the chronically poor in the shape of climate change and the fuel and food price spikes. And, given the large numbers of poor people now in Middle Income Countries, the practical possibilities for providing protection are greater than they were. Consideration of chronic poverty runs in parallel with a rise in interest in addressing inequality.
In other respects, there has been marginal change, and, given the disappointing results in terms of achieving the modest Millennium Development Goals targets, more radical change in thinking is now called for. The MDGs themselves have been marginally improved (for example, the important addition of universal access to sexual and reproductive health services), but critical factors preventing greater achievements have not been adequately addressed — principally, vulnerability, employment, and violent conflict.

The changes in policy emphasis required now to make greater progress towards the eradication of poverty and deprivation include the following 5 critical areas:

1. **Specific policies and programmes are needed to target the poorest people**, in addition to those already catering for the less poor. The poorest are very hard to reach, so policies need to be designed to overcome the multiple barriers they face. This includes rolling out national systems of social transfers as a practical entry point into the more difficult and context-specific questions around how economic growth and human development services can best include chronically poor people, and how society can progressively transform itself in favour of greater equity. Mexico and Brazil’s conditional cash transfers provide the leading examples, followed by India’s employment guarantee and Ethiopia’s safety net programme.

2. **To be effective, policies need to be designed to address the structural causes of chronic poverty**. Social and political exclusion from key institutions, discrimination against chronically poor groups, and adverse incorporation into institutions and development processes are all facets of chronic poverty, which, if not addressed, may simply leave the basic reasons why people stay poor in place. While governments cannot wish away what are often deeply embedded aspects of institutional and societal functioning, they can show leadership through legislation, enforcement, and creating appropriate incentives for behaviour change. Reforming marriage laws and inheritance practices in favour of widows and divorced women provide live examples in several countries.

3. **Exiting poverty requires attention to job quality, as well as access to quality health services and education** needed to incorporate poor people more effectively in the labour market. Job quality is as important as the quantity of employment, and governments need to be freer to intervene sensibly in labour markets to achieve this. They also need to recognise that escaping poverty involves access to more than basic education and health services, and that, while the quality of the latter is critical, large-scale investment in post-primary education and health systems is also now needed. Finally, new synergies need to be achieved between (i) education and the labour market; and (ii) asset building, asset protection and improved market returns from assets.

4. **Better data is required to inform the design and monitoring of policy**. A particular priority is to invest in panel surveys, with accompanying qualitative research, which enable governments to measure deprivation and wellbeing over time. These investments will enable greater disaggregated understanding of changes in poverty and wellbeing, the causes of such changes, as well as better policy evaluation. Having such information in the public domain is critical for a transparent discussion on what best reduces poverty. For example, demonstration that Bangladesh’s girls’ education stipend was not making much difference to outcomes led to a substantial raising of the stipend.

5. **The post-2015 development framework needs to retain the eradication of poverty as its central goal**. There should be a clear completion date by which absolute poverty is eradicated. The remaining period to 2015 should be used intensively to experiment with approaches and programmes which can help set the direction of travel towards this goal. The target date for achieving the goal should be set sooner rather than later, given the greater difficulties eradicating poverty once the impacts of climate change escalate.
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgements</th>
<th>ii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acronyms and abbreviations</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter 1: The big idea: chronic poverty, the MDGs and the CPRC

1. What is chronic poverty?  
2. The CPRC  
3. Chronic and severe poverty: no shortcuts on data  
4. Why is chronic poverty important?  
5. Selection of key issues in this paper  

### Chapter 2: Chronic poverty: unpacking the poverty ‘black box’

1. The four ‘ds’  
2. Intergenerational poverty  

### Chapter 3: Chronic poverty: key findings

1. The statistics on chronic poverty and poverty dynamics  
2. The significance of context: the nature and causes of chronic poverty compared  
3. Assets and markets  
4. Vulnerability and protection  
   4.1 Labour markets  
   4.2 Changing household demography  
   4.3 Assets-markets-protection synergies  
5. Social, economic and political relations: adverse incorporation and social exclusion  
   5.1 The worst forms of adverse incorporation  
   5.2 Measures against discrimination  
6. Location  
   6.1 Landlocked countries  
   6.2 Conflict  

---

## Chapter 1: The big idea: chronic poverty, the MDGs and the CPRC

1. **What is chronic poverty?**

2. **The CPRC**

3. **Chronic and severe poverty: no shortcuts on data**

4. **Why is chronic poverty important?**

5. **Selection of key issues in this paper**

## Chapter 2: Chronic poverty: unpacking the poverty ‘black box’

1. **The four ‘ds’**

2. **Intergenerational poverty**

## Chapter 3: Chronic poverty: key findings

1. **The statistics on chronic poverty and poverty dynamics**

2. **The significance of context: the nature and causes of chronic poverty compared**

3. **Assets and markets**

4. **Vulnerability and protection**
   
   4.1 **Labour markets**

   4.2 **Changing household demography**

   4.3 **Assets-markets-protection synergies**

5. **Social, economic and political relations: adverse incorporation and social exclusion**
   
   5.1 **The worst forms of adverse incorporation**

   5.2 **Measures against discrimination**

6. **Location**
   
   6.1 **Landlocked countries**

   6.2 **Conflict**
Chapter 4: Chronic poverty: the policy implications

1 Social protection
2 Economic growth
   2.1 Growth, labour markets and labour relations
   2.2 Assets, markets and protection
   2.3 Integration of chronically deprived countries and regions
   2.4 Focus on youth and young adults
   2.5 New, focused social contracts in post-conflict recovery
3 Progressive social change – addressing discrimination and deep-rooted inequalities
4 A commitment to improving the data
5 Answering the ‘how?’ question

Chapter 5: Future research and action

Annex

Annex 1: Summary analysis of country research findings and policy conclusions
Annex 2: CPRC’s research questions
Figures

Figure 1: Cartogram of $1/day poverty by country  
Figure 2. Trends in average and chronic poverty, Bangladesh 1991/2-2010  
Figure 3: Declining incidence of chronic poverty over time

Tables

Table 1:  New knowledge produced by CPRC and its policy implications  
Table 2: Chronically poor and poverty dynamics in CPRC partner countries  
Table 3: Incidence of chronic poverty over time  
Table 4: Typology of partner countries’ poverty situation and leading causes of chronic poverty  
Table 5: Average growth rates for landlocked countries

Boxes

Box 1: Declining wellbeing status over time – Amin and Rohima  
Box 2: What does it mean to be chronically poor?  
Box 3: The relationship between chronic and severe poverty  
Box 4: Poverty dynamics – patterns of escaping poverty compared  
Box 5: Sequencing qualitative and quantitative methods to study poverty dynamics in rural Bangladesh  
Box 6: A case of asset stripping  
Box 7: Asset-based poverty traps?  
Box 8: What the evidence tells us about social protection  
Box 9: A multi-party labour inspection process for India?  
Box 10: India’s rights-based approach  
Box 11: ‘Slave labour’ in Brazil  
Box 12: Addressing ethnic discrimination in Vietnam  
Box 13: An innovative policy design for Uganda’s social protection pilot  
Box 14: India – the need for broad-based rather than rapid growth  
Box 15: Tanzania’s recent emphasis on the labour market and employment  
Box 16: Stemming Girls’ Chronic Poverty